

Animal testing for livestock farming

David B. Morton
(University of Birmingham, UK)

dbmgm2@gmail.com

1

WHO DECIDES AND HOW?

1. To make a direct contribution to the importance of the species itself. This involves improving the health and welfare of animals in livestock farming.

If, during the research the target animals may still be harmed the benefits must outweigh the harms for the livestock sector?

Individual vs the sector

2

WHO DECIDES AND HOW?

2. To maximise benefits in an optimal balance between harms and the goals of sustainable livestock farming, animal welfare and health, the environment, public health, food security and the economy.

By organizing and stimulating such a debate with the sector and the government, the CCD can give more direction when considering these issues.

3

WHO DECIDES AND HOW?

3. Must have an active contribution to the 3Rs (replacement, reduction, refinement) and education

4

EU Directive 2010/63/EU Exemptions

1. non-experimental agricultural practices
2. non-experimental clinical veterinary practices
3. veterinary clinical trials required for the marketing authorisation of a veterinary medicinal product
4. practices undertaken for the purposes of recognised animal husbandry
5. practices undertaken for the primary purpose of identification of an animal
6. Practices not likely to cause pain, suffering, distress or lasting harm equivalent to, or higher than, that caused by the introduction of a needle in accordance with good veterinary practice.

5

Non-experimental agricultural and husbandry practices

Question:

If they are not experimental why are they being carried out?

NO ADVERSE EFFECTS e.g. observing behaviour, minimal risk

6

Interpretation of the EU Directive 2010/63/EU

So even if the practice or proposed practice does cause more pain, suffering, distress or lasting harm than "...the introduction of a needle in accordance with good veterinary practice"...

the proposed procedures/project may still be allowed/permitted WITHOUT needing licences under the EU directive

PROVIDING

1. it is a recognised animal husbandry/agricultural practice
2. It has been evaluated by an authority (e.g. an ethics committee, government agency)???

WHO and HOW???

Non-experimental agricultural practices

• Mutilations that are known to cause (more) pain than "...the introduction of a needle.... etc.

• **NOTE:** Distress not defined in any way – and yet is the most likely!!

• **PAIN:**

• **DISCOMFORT:**

• **DISTRESS:**

• **PREDISPOSITION PREDICTABLE ADVERSE EFFECTS**

- Any 'new/modified' agricultural practice regardless of whether it:
- Increases production, better economics, sustainability, environmentally friendly, etc
 - Provides better health and welfare

Examples of non-experimental agricultural practices

• Mutilations and many practices are already known to cause pain, suffering, distress or lasting harm equivalent to, or higher than, that caused by the introduction of a needle in accordance with good veterinary practice

• **PAIN:** methods castration, docking, disbudding, debeaking, teeth trimming, rearing and weaning practices, identification, Advanced artificial breeding techniques (surgical embryo transfer, vasectomy).

• **DISCOMFORT:** Breeding techniques: AI, ET, PD

• **DISTRESS:** feed limitation in broiler breeders, rearing and weaning, many husbandry practices tethering, restraint, confinement, mixing, grouping, transport

• **LASTING HARMS- PREDISPOSITIONS:** Genetic modification, genetic selection procedures, phenotype selection

• **SUFFERING?** COMBINATION of all above?

Examples of practices undertaken for recognised animal husbandry purposes that can cause pain, distress and discomfort

- Single housing of animals
- Mixing/re-grouping of animals after weaning
- Mixing of animals e.g. before maturation, after sales, when pregnant
- Confinement and tethering (bulls, cows)
- Restraint for manipulations
- Vaginal swabbing
- Grid flooring (birds, swine)
- Weighing fish under anaesthesia
- Diet management and manipulation, feed limitation in broiler breeders, obese animals)
- Hormonal tampons
- Transport

10

Practices undertaken for the primary purpose of identification of an animal (level of harm?)

1. Ear tagging
2. Tattooing
3. Implants e.g. telemeters, data loggers, transponders, RFIDs (Radio-Frequency IDs)
4. Boluses by mouth or gavage
5. GPS trackers

11

RESEARCH QUESTIONS

- **IS IT GOOD SCIENCE?**
- What is the purpose of the work?
 - Improve health, improve welfare or reduce animal harms
 - Improve productivity, sustainability, economic
- **UNDER RESEARCH DIRECTIVE OR AN EXEMPTION?**
- Would it be done in normal/recognised agricultural practice?
- Is it within existing animal welfare legislation?
- Does it raise any fundamental ethical questions e.g. genetic modification, genetic selection (Belgian Blues)?
- Minimal risk - less harm than the introduction of a needle in accordance with good veterinary practice e.g. behavioural observations,

12

RESEARCH QUESTIONS - IS IT GOOD SCIENCE?

THEN

- APPLICATION OF THE THREE RS

THEN

- Harm : benefit analysis – how to do it???

13

UNDER RESEARCH DIRECTIVE OR AN EXEMPTION? WHO DECIDES and HOW - CRITERIA?

- Accepted recognised agricultural /AH/ID practice
 - by whom - Local or National Committee?
- Composition of the deciding group (skill or representational based).
- National and EU standardisation/harmonisation/laws?
- Who evaluates and decides on the ethical issues in a proposal:
 - Acceptable purpose,
 - 3Rs and avoidable suffering)
 - Minimum risk to achieve purpose
 - Will cause more pain, suffering, distress or lasting harm than Vet injection?
 - If so is it justified?
 - H:B assessment

14

SUMMARY

1. RESEARCH WORK ON FARMED ANIMALS UNDERGOING RECOGNISED (ACCEPTED) AGRICULTURAL PRACTICES MAY QUALIFY FOR AN EXEMPTION FROM 2010/63/EU

CONSIDERABLE FINANCIAL SAVINGS, CONVENIENCE AND COMPLIANCE
2. WHO DECIDES ON WHAT IS RECOGNISED AGRICULTURAL AND HUSBANDRY PRACTICES ?
3. WHAT AUTHORITY(S) DEALS WITH THE ETHICAL ISSUES AND CONTROLS SUCH WORK TO ENSURE GOOD SCIENCE, MINIMAL HARM, ACCEPTABLE BENEFITS AND PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY

15
